

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:16-cv-07140-GHW**

Charles Seife v. U.S. Department of State  
Assigned to: Judge Gregory H. Woods  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 09/13/2016  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff****Charles Seife**

represented by **Charles Seife**  
2 Washington Sq. VLG  
#2R  
New York, NY 10012  
212/673-1645  
Email: [cs129@NYU.EDU](mailto:cs129@NYU.EDU)  
PRO SE

V.

**Defendant****U.S. Department of State**

represented by **Dominika Natalia Tarczynska**  
United States Attorney's Office  
Southern District Of New York  
86 Chambers Street, Third Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 637-2748  
Fax: (212) 637-2686  
Email: [dominika.tarczynska@usdoj.gov](mailto:dominika.tarczynska@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Peter Max Aronoff**

United States Attorney's Office for the SDNY  
86 Chambers Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-637-2697  
Fax: 212-637-2686  
Email: [peter.aronoff@usdoj.gov](mailto:peter.aronoff@usdoj.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

| Date Filed | #        | Docket Text                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|------------|----------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 09/13/2016 | <u>1</u> | COMPLAINT against U.S. Department of State. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 465401161888) Document filed by Charles Seife.(dgo) (Entered: 09/13/2016)                                                                                                                                                           |
| 09/13/2016 |          | SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of State. (dgo) (Entered: 09/13/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 09/13/2016 |          | Magistrate Judge James L. Cott is so designated. (dgo) (Entered: 09/13/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 09/13/2016 |          | Case Designated ECF. (dgo) (Entered: 09/13/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 10/03/2016 | <u>3</u> | PRO SE CONSENT TO RECEIVE ELECTRONIC SERVICE. The following party: Charles G. Seife consents to receive electronic service via the ECF system. Document filed by Charles Seife.(sc) (Entered: 10/05/2016)                                                                                                             |
| 10/03/2016 | <u>4</u> | SUMMONS RETURNED EXECUTED Summons and Complaint served. U.S. Department of State served on 9/13/2016, answer due 11/14/2016. Service was made by Cert. Mail to U.S. Attorney's Office, One St. Andrews Plaza, New York, N.Y., and to Attorney General, U.S. Dept. of Justice, Washington, DC 20530, and to U.S. Dept. |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|------------|-----------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            |           | of State, Washington, DC 20520. Document filed by Charles Seife. (sc) (Entered: 10/05/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 10/06/2016 | <u>5</u>  | LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Li Yu dated 10/6/2016. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Yu, Li) (Entered: 10/06/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 10/06/2016 | <u>6</u>  | ORDER granting <u>5</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer. Application granted. The deadline for defendant to answer or otherwise respond to the complaint is extended to November 16, 2016. The Court notes that Rule 12(a)(2) provides the United States 60 days to respond to a complaint in the ordinary course. SO ORDERED. U.S. Department of State answer due 11/16/2016. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 10/06/2016) (ama) (Entered: 10/07/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 10/06/2016 | <u>7</u>  | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Charles Seife dated 10/6/2016 re: I write respectfully to oppose defense counsel's request for a 30 day extension of time in which to file an answer to the complaint. Document filed by Charles Seife.(vn) (Entered: 10/11/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 10/12/2016 | <u>8</u>  | NOTICE OF INITIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 11/22/2016 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 12C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Gregory H. Woods. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 10/12/2016) (kko) (Entered: 10/12/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 10/19/2016 | <u>9</u>  | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Dominika Natalia Tarczyska on behalf of U.S. Department of State. (Tarczyska, Dominika) (Entered: 10/19/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 11/15/2016 | <u>10</u> | JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczyska and Charles Seife dated November 15, 2016 re: Joint Letter in advance of Initial Conference. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczyska, Dominika) (Entered: 11/15/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 11/16/2016 | <u>11</u> | ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczyska, Dominika) (Entered: 11/16/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 11/17/2016 | <u>12</u> | MOTION FOR PERMISSION FOR ELECTRONIC CASE FILING; re: for Permission for Charles Seife to participate in electronic case filing in this case. Document filed by Charles Seife.(sc) (Entered: 11/18/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 11/21/2016 | <u>13</u> | ORDER granting <u>12</u> Motion for Permission for Electronic Case Filing. Plaintiff's motion for permission for electronic case filing, Dkt. No. 12, is granted. The Clerk of Court is directed to designate this matter as an ECF case. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Gregory H. Woods)(Text Only Order) (Woods, Gregory) (Entered: 11/21/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 11/22/2016 |           | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Gregory H. Woods: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 11/22/2016. (Court Reporter Steven Griffing) (Daniels, A.) (Entered: 11/23/2016)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 11/28/2016 | <u>14</u> | ORDER. As stated on the record during the conference held on November 22, 2016, the Department of State is ordered to respond to Plaintiff's first FOIA request no later than December 16, 2016. The Department of State is ordered to provide rolling responses to Plaintiff's second FOIA request, with the initial round of responsive documents, if any, to be produced no later than December 16, 2016. The Department of State is ordered to complete its response to Plaintiff's second FOIA request no later than January 20, 2017. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Gregory H. Woods on November 28, 2016) (Text Only Order)(Woods, Gregory) (Entered: 11/28/2016) |
| 01/20/2017 | <u>15</u> | TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 11/22/2016 before Judge Gregory H. Woods. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Steven Griffing, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 2/10/2017. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 2/21/2017. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/20/2017.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 01/20/2017)                                                                                                          |
| 01/20/2017 | <u>16</u> | NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 11/22/16 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|------------|-----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            |           | (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 01/20/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 03/10/2017 | <u>17</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated March 10, 2017 re: Additional Searches. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 03/10/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 03/10/2017 | <u>18</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>17</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of State. ENDORSEMENT: On November 28, 2016, the Court entered an order directing the Government to complete its response to Plaintiff's second FOIA request no later than January 20, 2017. Dkt. No. 14. The Court construes this letter as a request for an extension of that deadline. The application is granted, and the deadline for the Government to complete its response to Plaintiff's second FOIA request is extended to April 17, 2017. In addition, the parties are directed to submit a joint letter no later than May 15, 2017 describing the status of this case. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 3/10/2017) (mro) (Entered: 03/13/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 05/15/2017 | <u>19</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from AUSA Anthony J. Sun dated 5/15/2017 re: Status Update. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Sun, Anthony) (Entered: 05/15/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 05/19/2017 | 20        | ORDER. The Court will hold an in-person pre-motion conference to discuss the parties' proposed cross-motions for summary judgment on May 22, 2017 at 11:00 a.m. The conference will take place at the Daniel Patrick Moynihan United States Court House, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York, in Courtroom 12C. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Gregory H. Woods on May 19, 2017) (Text Only Order)(Woods, Gregory) (Entered: 05/19/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 05/22/2017 |           | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Gregory H. Woods: Pre-Motion Conference held on 5/22/2017. (Court Reporter Kristen Carannante) (Daniels, Anthony) (Entered: 05/22/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 05/22/2017 | 21        | ORDER. As stated on the record during the conference held on May 22, 2017, the parties are granted leave to file cross-motions for summary judgment. The State Department's motion for summary judgment is due no later than June 5, 2017. Plaintiff's combined cross-motion for summary judgment and opposition to the State Department's motion is due no later than June 26, 2017. The State Department's combined opposition to Plaintiff's cross-motion and reply in support of its motion is due no later than July 17, 2017. Plaintiff's reply in support of his cross-motion is due no later than August 7, 2017. The parties are granted leave to proceed at this time without the submission of a Local Rule 56.1 statement. The Court may reconsider that decision after reviewing the parties' submissions. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Gregory H. Woods on May 22, 2017) (Text Only Order)(Woods, Gregory) (Entered: 05/22/2017) |
| 06/02/2017 | <u>22</u> | CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Summary Judgment Motions</i> addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated June 2, 2017. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/02/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 06/05/2017 | <u>23</u> | ORDER granting <u>22</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Application granted. The summary judgment briefing schedule entered by the Court on May 22, 2017 (Dkt. No. 21) is adjourned. The parties are directed to submit a joint letter no later than June 15, 2017 describing the status of the additional searches and productions as well as a new proposed schedule for summary judgment briefing. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the letter motion at Dkt. No. 22. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 6/5/2017) (anc) Modified on 6/16/2017 (anc). (Entered: 06/05/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 06/15/2017 | 24        | ORDER. By order dated June 5, 2017, the parties were directed to submit a joint status letter no later than June 14, 2017. Dkt. No. 23. The Court has not received that letter. The parties are directed to comply with the Court's June 5, 2017 letter forthwith. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Gregory H. Woods on June 15, 2017) (Text Only Order)(Woods, Gregory) (Entered: 06/15/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|------------|-----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 06/15/2017 | <u>25</u> | JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated June 15, 2017 re: Case Status and Proposed Summary Judgment Briefing Schedule. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/15/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 06/16/2017 | <u>26</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>25</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of State. ENDORSEMENT: The Court thanks the parties for their explanation with respect to the timeliness of their joint status report. The Court adopts the following briefing schedule for the parties cross-motions for summary judgment: The State Department's motion for summary judgment is due no later than July 27, 2017. Plaintiff's combined cross-motion for summary judgment and opposition to the State Department's motion is due no later than August 17, 2017. The State Department's combined opposition to Plaintiff's motion and reply in support of its motion is due no later than September 11, 2017. Plaintiff's reply in support of his cross-motion is due no later than October 2, 2017. The parties are granted leave to proceed at this time without the submission of a Local Rule 56.1 statement. The Court may reconsider that decision after reviewing the parties' submissions. ( Cross Motions due by 8/17/2017., Motions due by 7/27/2017., Responses due by 9/11/2017, Replies due by 10/2/2017.) (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 6/16/2017) (mro) (Entered: 06/16/2017) |
| 07/27/2017 | <u>27</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 07/27/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 07/27/2017 | <u>28</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 07/27/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 07/27/2017 | <u>29</u> | DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 (Vaughn Index), # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18)(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 07/27/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 08/17/2017 | <u>30</u> | CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Charles Seife. Responses due by 9/11/2017(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 08/17/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 08/17/2017 | <u>31</u> | DECLARATION of Charles Seife in Support re: <u>30</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Charles Seife. (Seife, Charles) (Entered: 08/17/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 08/17/2017 | <u>32</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>30</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Charles Seife. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Supplement)(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 08/17/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 08/17/2017 | <u>33</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>30</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Charles Seife. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Supplement)(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 08/17/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 09/11/2017 | <u>34</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 09/11/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 09/11/2017 | <u>35</u> | DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 19 (Updated Vaughn Index), # <u>2</u> Exhibit 20)(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 09/11/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 09/25/2017 | <u>36</u> | LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages <i>in reply due Oct. 2, 2017</i> addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Charles Seife dated 9/25/2017. Document filed by Charles Seife.(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 09/25/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 09/25/2017 |           | Set/Reset Deadlines: Replies due by 10/2/2017. (mro) (Entered: 09/26/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 09/26/2017 | <u>37</u> | ORDER granting <u>36</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages Application granted. Plaintiff is granted leave to file a reply brief in support of his cross-motion for summary judgment (Dkt. No. 30) of up to, but not to exceed, fifteen pages in length. Plaintiff's reply brief remains due no later than October 2, 2017, in accordance with the Court's June 16, 2017 order (Dkt. No. 26). (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 9/25/2017) (mro) Modified on 11/2/2017 (mro). (Entered: 09/26/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|------------|-----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 09/27/2017 | <u>38</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>30</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . <i>and opposed to defendant's motion for Summary Judgment.</i> Document filed by Charles Seife. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit D, # <u>2</u> Exhibit E, # <u>3</u> Exhibit F, # <u>4</u> Supplement)(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 09/27/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 09/27/2017 | <u>39</u> | DECLARATION of Charles Seife in Support re: <u>30</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Charles Seife. (Seife, Charles) (Entered: 09/27/2017)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 03/26/2018 | <u>40</u> | MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER re: <u>27</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by U.S. Department of State, <u>30</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Charles Seife. For the reasons stated above, the State Department's motion for summary judgment is GRANTED IN PART and DENIED IN PART without prejudice. Mr. Seife's cross-motion is DENIED. The denial of the Mr. Seife's motion is without prejudice to the extent that the motion challenges the State Department's response to the 12997 request, the withholding of documents and information under Exemption 5, and the withholding of the identities of the background briefers under Exemption 6. The State Department is directed to submit revised Vaughn submissions addressing the State Department's response to the 12997 request, the information and document claimed exempt under Exemption 5, the identities of background briefers claimed exempt under Exemption 6, as well as a segregability analysis addressing the Category 15 document, along with a renewed motion for partial summary judgment no later than April 30, 2018. Mr. Seife may file a renewed cross-motion for summary judgment with respect to the State Department's response to the 12997 request and its withholding of information and documents under Exemptions 5 and 6 no later than thirty (30) days from the date of service of the State Department's renewed motion. Any oppositions to the motion(s) for summary judgment are due no later than twenty-one (21) days following service of the motions, and any replies are due no later than fourteen (14) days following service of the oppositions. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motions pending at Dkt. Nos. 27 and 30. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 3/24/2018) (mro) (Entered: 03/26/2018) |
| 04/23/2018 | <u>41</u> | FIRST LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Letter Motion for 2-week Stay of Summary Judgment Briefing Schedule</i> addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated April 23, 2018. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/23/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 04/23/2018 | <u>42</u> | COUNTER LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>in opposition to Docket #41</i> addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Charles Seife dated 4/23/2018. Document filed by Charles Seife.(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 04/23/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 04/24/2018 | <u>43</u> | ORDER terminating <u>41</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time; granting in part <u>42</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Application granted in part. The Court grants Defendant's request for an extension of the briefing deadlines, but agrees with Plaintiff's argument in his opposition (Dkt. No. 42) that a blanket stay of the deadlines is inappropriate. The deadline for Defendant's renewed summary judgment motion and revised Vaughn index, in accordance with the Court's March 26, 2018 memorandum opinion and order (Dkt. No. 40), is extended to May 30, 2018. In the event that Defendant elects to voluntarily produce additional information in response to FOIA Request No. 12996, Defendant is directed to do so no later than May 21, 2018 and to file a letter informing the Court of the fact of the production. In the event that Defendant decides against an additional voluntary production in response to that request, it is directed to file a letter advising the Court of that decision no later than May 21, 2018. The Court also expects that Defendant will promptly produce any disclosable information that its search in response to FOIA Request No. 12997 may uncover. Except as expressly modified by this order, the briefing schedule established by the Court's March 26, 2018 order remains in place. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motions pending at Dkt. Nos. 41 and 42. Motions due by 5/30/2018. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 4/24/2018) (mro) (Entered: 04/24/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 05/21/2018 | <u>44</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated May 21, 2018 re: FOIA Request No. F-2014-12996 Voluntary Production. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 05/21/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 05/29/2018 | <u>45</u> | SECOND LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>updated Vaughn submission &amp; renewed motion for summary judgment</i> addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated May 29, 2018. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 05/29/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|------------|-----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 05/29/2018 | <u>46</u> | ORDER granting <u>45</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File. Application granted. The deadline for the filing of the Government's updated Vaughn index and renewed summary judgment motion is extended to June 6, 2018. The Government should expect no further extensions of this deadline. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 5/29/2018) (mro) (Entered: 05/29/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 05/29/2018 |           | Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 6/6/2018. (mro) (Entered: 05/29/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 06/06/2018 | <u>47</u> | CONSENT LETTER MOTION to Seal Document <i>Application Seeking Leave to File Ex Parte Declaration Under Seal</i> addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated June 6, 2018. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/06/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 06/06/2018 | <u>48</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/06/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 06/06/2018 | <u>49</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>48</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/06/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 06/06/2018 | <u>50</u> | DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: <u>48</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 21 (Vaughn Index), # <u>2</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 24)(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/06/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 06/12/2018 | <u>51</u> | SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(rz) (Entered: 06/12/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 07/02/2018 | <u>52</u> | CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Charles Seife. Responses due by 7/23/2018(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 07/02/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 07/02/2018 | <u>53</u> | DECLARATION of Charles Seife in Support re: <u>52</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Charles Seife. (Seife, Charles) (Entered: 07/02/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 07/02/2018 | <u>54</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>52</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Charles Seife. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit G, # <u>2</u> Exhibit H part 1, # <u>3</u> Exhibit H part 2, # <u>4</u> Exhibit H part 3, # <u>5</u> Exhibit H part 4, # <u>6</u> Exhibit H part 5, # <u>7</u> Exhibit H part 6, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H part 7, # <u>9</u> Exhibit H part 8, # <u>10</u> Exhibit H part 9, # <u>11</u> Exhibit H part 10, # <u>12</u> Exhibit H part 11, # <u>13</u> Exhibit H part 12, # <u>14</u> Exhibit H part 13, # <u>15</u> Exhibit H part 14, # <u>16</u> Exhibit I, # <u>17</u> Exhibit J part 1, # <u>18</u> Exhibit J part 2, # <u>19</u> Exhibit K, # <u>20</u> Exhibit L, # <u>21</u> Exhibit M)(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 07/02/2018) |
| 07/09/2018 | <u>55</u> | FIRST LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>52</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Peter Aronoff dated 7/9/2018. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Aronoff, Peter) (Entered: 07/09/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 07/10/2018 | <u>56</u> | ORDER granting <u>55</u> FIRST LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to 52 CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Peter Aronoff dated 7/9/2018. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. Application granted. The deadline for Defendant's combined opposition to Plaintiff's summary judgment motion and reply in support of its summary judgment motion is extended to August 3, 2018. So ordered. (Responses due by 8/3/2018. Replies due by 8/3/2018). (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 7/10/2018) (rjm) (Entered: 07/10/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 08/03/2018 | <u>57</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>48</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . and In Opposition to Plaintiff's Cross Motion for Summary Judgment. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 08/03/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 08/03/2018 | <u>58</u> | DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: <u>48</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 27)(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 08/03/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 08/14/2018 | <u>59</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated August 14, 2018 re: Filing of Redacted Version of Declaration Previously Submitted Under Seal. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Redacted Version of Previously Submitted Ex Parte Declaration of Eric F. Stein)(Tarczynska,                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|------------|-----------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|            |           | Dominika) (Entered: 08/14/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 08/15/2018 | <u>60</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>52</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment . <i>and opposed to defendant's motion for Summary Judgment.</i> Document filed by Charles Seife. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit N, # <u>2</u> Exhibit O, # <u>3</u> Exhibit P)(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 08/15/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 08/15/2018 | <u>61</u> | DECLARATION of Charles Seife in Support re: <u>52</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Charles Seife. (Seife, Charles) (Entered: 08/15/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 08/15/2018 | <u>62</u> | DECLARATION of Charles Seife in Support re: <u>52</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Charles Seife. (Seife, Charles) (Entered: 08/15/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 08/17/2018 | <u>63</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on <u>59</u> Letter denying <u>47</u> Motion to Seal Document. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. On June 6, 2018 the Defendant submitted the ex parte declaration of Eric Stein ("the declaration") to the Court, and requested that the Court place the declaration under seal. Dkt. No. 47. On August 14, 2018 the Defendant submitted a redacted version of the declaration, and applied for leave to file the redacted declaration on the docket. Dkt. No. 59. That application is granted. Whether the Government may ultimately withhold the redacted information is at issue in this case, and the Court reserves judgment on that issue. Defendant's June 6, 2018 letter motion (Dkt. No. 47) is denied as it is no longer germane. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motion pending at Dkt. No. 47. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 8/17/2018) (mro) (Entered: 08/20/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 12/20/2018 | <u>64</u> | NOTICE of Supplemental Authority. Document filed by Charles Seife. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Q)(Seife, Charles) (Entered: 12/20/2018)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 03/06/2019 | <u>65</u> | MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER re: <u>48</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by U.S. Department of State, <u>52</u> CROSS MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Charles Seife. For the reasons stated above, Plaintiffs motion for summary judgment is DENIED, and the State Department's motion for summary judgment is GRANTED IN PART and DENIED IN PART. For the avoidance of doubt, the Court provides the following summary of the outcome of Defendant's motion for summary judgment: REQUEST F-2014-12997: Summary judgment is granted in favor of the State Department as to the search for State-Department produced transcripts, and denied as to the search for non-State-Department-Produced-Transcripts. Exemption 5: Summary judgment is granted in favor of the State Department as to all applications of Exemption 5 in the Revised Vaughn Index, except for Categories 5 (subject to footnote nine, above), 13, and 18 for which summary judgment is denied. Exemption 6: Summary judgment is granted in favor of the State Department, except as to the individual discussed in footnote four of the Fourth Declaration of Eric F. Stein. The remaining issues are discrete, and the Court expects that they may be resolved by conferral amongst the parties. The Court directs the parties to so confer, and to submit a joint status letter to the Court describing what, if any, issues remain in this case no later than three weeks following the date of this opinion and order. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motions pending at docket numbers 48 and 52. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 3/6/2019) (anc) (Entered: 03/06/2019) |
| 03/28/2019 | <u>66</u> | JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated March 28, 2019 re: Joint Status Letter. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 03/28/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 03/29/2019 | <u>67</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>66</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of State. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties are directed to submit the joint status letter described above no later than April 12, 2019. Also no later than April 12, 2019, Defendant is directed to submit the Category 13 and 18 documents referenced above for in camera review. To the extent Defendant proposes to release any documents in those categories subject to redactions, the Court requests that the documents be marked to visually demonstrate which portions of the documents are subject to the proposed redactions without obscuring the text for example, via highlighting. To the extent Defendant proposes to withhold any document in full, the document should be marked accordingly. By that same date, the parties are granted leave to submit letter briefs as to any issues pertinent to the Court's in camera review. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 3/29/2019) (anc) Modified on 4/2/2019 (anc). (Entered: 03/29/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |

|            |           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|------------|-----------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 04/12/2019 | <u>68</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/12/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 04/12/2019 | <u>69</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>68</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . <i>Letter Brief In Support of Motion Regarding Category 13 and 18 documents.</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/12/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 04/12/2019 | <u>70</u> | DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: <u>68</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 28)(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/12/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 04/12/2019 | <u>71</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated April 12, 2019 re: Cover Letter Transmitting Documents for In Camera Review. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/12/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 04/12/2019 | <u>72</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated April 12, 2019 re: Status of FOIA Request F-2014-12997 Search Parameters. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 04/12/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 04/18/2019 | <u>73</u> | ORDER granting <u>68</u> Motion for Summary Judgment. Accordingly, summary judgment is GRANTED to the Defendants as to the Category 13 and 18 documents. No later than May 10, 2019, the parties are directed to submit a joint status letter updating the Court as to what, if any, disputes remain in this case. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motion pending at Dkt. No. 68. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 4/18/2019) (anc) (Entered: 04/18/2019) |
| 05/10/2019 | <u>74</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated May 10, 2019 re: Status Letter. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 05/10/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 05/13/2019 | <u>75</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>74</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of State. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties are directed to submit a supplemental status letter no later than June 12, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 5/13/2019) (anc) (Entered: 05/14/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 06/12/2019 | <u>76</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Gregory H. Woods from Dominika Tarczynska dated June 12, 2019 re: Status Report. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Tarczynska, Dominika) (Entered: 06/12/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 06/13/2019 | <u>77</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: <u>76</u> Letter filed by U.S. Department of State. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties are directed to submit a supplemental status letter no later than July 15, 2019. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gregory H. Woods on 6/13/2019) (ama) (Entered: 06/13/2019)                                                                                                                                                                                       |